

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

ELIZABETH CHAN, TAMARA HOFFMAN,  
RACHEL EHRENPREIS, CHAIM KATZ, WINNIE  
CHEUNG, MEIR EHRENPREIS, JOHN BAILEY,  
SEAN CARNEY, LUIS DIAZ AND FAMILIES FOR  
A BETTER PLAN FOR CONGESTION,

Plaintiffs,

v.

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF  
TRANSPORTATION, FEDERAL HIGHWAY  
ADMINISTRATION, THE METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY, THE  
TRIBOROUGH BRIDGE AND TUNNEL  
AUTHORITY, SHAILEN BHATT, in his official  
capacity as Administrator of the Federal Highway  
Administration, RICHARD J. MARQUIS, in his  
official capacity as Division Administrator of the New  
York Division of the Federal Highway  
Administration, NICHOLAS A. CHOUBAH, P.E. in  
his official capacity as Chief Engineer for the New  
York State Department of Transportation, WILLIAM  
J. CARRY in his official capacity as Assistant  
Commissioner for Policy for the New York City  
Department of Transportation,

Defendants.

Case No. 23-cv-10365-LJL  
[rel. 1:24-cv-01644-LJL]  
[rel. 1:23-cv-10365-LJL]

**Oral argument requested**

**DECLARATION OF ALAN M. KLINGER**

I, Alan M. Klinger, declare under penalty of perjury that the following statements are true and correct:

1. I am an attorney licensed and admitted to practice in the State of New York and a partner at Steptoe LLP, attorneys for Plaintiffs in the above-referenced matter. I submit this Declaration in support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment.

2. Attached hereto as **Exhibit A** is a glossary of acronyms used in Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Law in Support of its Motion for Summary Judgment.
3. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 1** is a true and correct copy of the Traffic Mobility Review Board's recommended toll structure, dated November 30, 2023.
4. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 2** is a true and correct copy of the Fix NYC Advisory Panel's recommendation, dated January 2018.
5. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 3** is a true and correct copy of the Environmental Impact Statement prepared for the Chesapeake Bay Crossing Study.
6. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 4** is a true and correct copy of the Environmental Impact Statement prepared for the Hood River-White Salmon Interstate Bridge Replacement Project.

Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1746, I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Dated: March 18, 2024  
New York, New York

/s/ Alan M. Klinger  
Alan M. Klinger